| S.No. | Bidding Document Reference(s)(Section Number/Page Number | RFP Clause | Points of Clarification Requested | Clarification Issued by CIL |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1 | Page- 4 Clause- 3.0 EMD (Earnest Money Deposit): | The bidder will have to make the payment of EMD through ONLINE mode only. | Please allow submission of Bank Guarantee for EMD along with Online mode | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |
| 2 | Page- 35 Clause- 4.2 Eligibility Criteria (EC) and Technical Evaluation Criteria: Technical Evaluation Criteria (TECDOCS); Point No 3 | Organisational Standards MSP organization should be a CMMI level 3 - SVC or above - 5 Marks CMMI level 3 -DEV or above -5 Marks | Request you to amend this clause as: Organisational Standards MSP organization should be a CMMI level 3 -SVC or above  - 5 Marks OR CMMI level 3 -DEV or above - 5 Marks Additional 5 marks for  valid ISO 27001 & 20000 | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |
| 3 | Page- 79 Clause- Miscellaneous Point no a | Successful Bidder to ensure that the Landing cloud infrastructure(CIDR for Network will be shared by CIL) for the application is deployed within 15 days of award of the contract. | Request you to amend this clause as: Successful Bidder to ensure that the Landing cloud infrastructure (CIDR for Network will be shared by CIL) for the application is deployed within 30 days of award of the contract. | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 4 | Page- 79 Clause- Miscellaneous Point no h | Project Manager of the MSP shall be Physically present for the Management Review Meetings necessary for Getting the certifications and Maintaining the same for the contractual period. CIL will not make any additional payment towards accommodation and traveling. | Kindly allow virtual mode presence for project manager during the review meetings. | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |
| 5 | Page- 79 Clause- Miscellaneous Point no k | Bidder will be responsible for managed services of the respective software. | Kindly mention the list of software where the bidder is suppose to provide managed services | Refers to Software used my MSP i.e.., Ticketing Systems and Change Management Systems if any |
| 6 | Page- 89 Clause- One time implementation | Inputs: Application Code(including static Files) and Postgres Database Dump | Please mention the size of application code and postgres database dump. Also mention if currently postgres is running with enterprise support or community support | Exact Details will be shared to the L1 Bidder; Sizes of Application and Database < 25 GB; |
| 7 | Page- 89 Clause- One time implementation, Point 13 | RTO and RPO for DR would be 30 minutes and 15 Min | This is subjected to application design and technology used in solution. IOCL has to approve solution design, Technology and tools to support the required RTO and RPO | RTO of 30 Min and 15 Min is feasible for the given technology stack |
| 8 | Page- 89 Clause- One time implementation, Note | Time line for the above delivery is WO(Work Order + 45 Days) | Request you to kindly set the delivery time lines to 60 Days | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |

| 9 | Page- 96 Clause- SLA | Service Levels for Cloud Services - Default on any one or more of the provisioned resource will attract penalty as indicated below. <99.9% & >=99% (10% of the Monthly Payment) < 99% (30% of the Monthly Payment) | Here we request to keep the penalty amount limited to the monthly value of default service only and not the entire monthly bill of entire services consumed by CIL. Also to re-consider penalty amount with discount over next month on monthly bill | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |

| 10 | Page- 96 Clause-5.10, VIII, | Penalties shall not exceed 100% of the Monthly bill. If the penalties exceed more than 50% of the total Monthly bill, it will result in a material breach. | The purpose of SLAs is to monitor the performance of the service provider during operations, penalization is for the purpose of his seriousness towards the job and parameters which we agreed to deliver and further improvement, there use to be no intent of the purchaser to make bidder financially unstable during the project lifecycle.<br>Adding SLAs up to 100% of the total bill categorized in 19 SLAs will bleed MSP during the project lifecycle and it will make him unstable for putting extra efforts on delivery and improving performances to mitigate gaps if any.<br>We request to kindly cap the maximum SLA penalty up to 20% in total of the MSP bill, and exceeding 50% of the penalties should be declared as material breach and remedial actions as per contract may be invoked. | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 11 | Page- 96 Clause-5.10, VIII, 1 | Availability/Uptime of cloud services Resources for Production environment (VMs,Storage, OS, Security Components)<br>Penalty default on any one or more of the provisioned resource will attract penalty as indicated below.<br><99.9% & >=99% (10% of the Monthly Payment)<br>< 99% (30% of the Monthly Payment) | Mentioned penalty percentage are on higher side for MSP. We request to consider discount(%) in next month usage instead of penalty. Also the structure could be following which is offered by the CSP:<br>Less than 99.99% but equal to or greater than 99.0%->10%<br>Less than 99.0% but equal to or greater than 95.0%->30%<br>Less than 95.0%->100%<br>Also the discount(%) should be limited to the monthly amount of provisioned resource only and not to the entire monthly bill. | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |
| 12 | Page- 71 Clause-22.0; Objections and Removals: | 22.1, the Service Provider shall appoint a replacement having the requisite expertise and qualifications within fifteen (15) days of such removal. | Request you to amend this clause as:<br>22.1, the Service Provider shall appoint a replacement having the requisite expertise and qualifications within Forty Five (45) days of such removal. | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |
| 13 | Page-  Clause- BOQ1 | CSP Support - Cost percentage of cloud consumption | if CSP is offering the support cost based on monthly usage, so MSP should quote blended cost or a fix cost needed to be provided for entire agreement? Kindly simply this for operations angle | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 14 | Page- 73 Clause- Section IV | 1 Full time onsite engineer | We suggest to keep onsite engineer payment on monthly basis instead of quarterly. | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |
| 15 | Page- 101 Clause- 5.10, VIII, 14 | Recovery Time Objective (RTO) Penalty clause 10% of Monthly Payment per every additional 2 (two) hours of downtime | Mentioned penalty percentage is on higher side, we request to kindly cap it to 5% for every additional 2 hours of downtime. Also this clause should be applicable if Coal India has deployed the solution where the provision of 2 hours of RTO is considered and approved at solution level by Coal India. In case the RTO is not considered during the solution phase then this SLA should not be applicable. | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |
| 16 | Page- 101 Clause- 5.10, VIII, 15 | Recovery Point Object (RPO) Penalty clause 10% of Monthly Payment per every additional minutes of data loss. | Mentioned penalty percentage is on higher side, we request to kindly cap it to 5% for every additional 30min of data loss. Also this clause should be applicable if Coal India has deployed the solution where the provision of <30min of RPO is considered and approved at solution level by Coal India. In case the RPO of <30min is not considered during the solution phase then this SLA should not be applicable. | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |

| 17 | Page- 60 Clause- Payment Schedule: | Payment Schedule: The payment against this contract shall be made on quarterly basis. The first quarterly bill for infrastructure for the period of service during 1st quarter, shall be raised at the end of 1st quarter after acceptance of infrastructure. | 1. Please change the payment to Monthly in arrears from Quarterly in arrears | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |

| 18 | Page- 48 Clause- 12.3. Procurement from Micro and Small Enterprises (MSEs) | i) Subject to meeting terms and conditions stated in the tender document including but not limiting to prequalification criteria, 25% of the work will be awarded to MSE as defined in MSE Procurement Policy issued by Department of Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises (MSME) for the tendered work/item. Where the tendered work can be split, MSE quoting a price within a price band of L1 + 15% shall be awarded at least 25% of total tendered work provided they match L1 price. In case the tendered work cannot be split, MSE shall be awarded full work provided their quoted price is within a price band of L1 + 15% and they match the L1 price. | Request you to remove this clasue. As this work ""Subscription to Basic/Advanced Cloud Services, Managed Services, CSP Consulting to enable Digital Transformation" is very critical & complex in nature. So, we request you to remove this clause and remove the prefrence given to be MSE Partner. As the nature of project is cloud service delivery through a CSP where splitting of work shall not be possible due to complexity in deployment and security of project. Apart from this there might be high chances that L1 bider and MSME bidder might quote services from two different CSP. Bidders being resellers of cloud services offered by CSP, supported by MAF from OEM hence preference to MSME should not be given. | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 19 | Page- 32 Clause-4.1.3 Undertaking by bidder on his/her/their Letter Head as per Annexure V: | Note: The confirmation from the bidder regarding matching of L1 price may be taken in confirmatory document link of e-Procurement portal by recycling 'Any other document' link. The work of "Subscription to Basic/Advanced Cloud Services, Managed Services, CSP Consulting to enable Digital Transformation" is to be executed by a single agency. Hence it has been considered as non-divisible. | If work under this tender in non-divisible, then we request to kindly remove clause 12.3. Procurement from Micro and Small Enterprises (MSEs), as conditions laid here in are contradictory to those mentioned in in referred note. | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |
| 20 | Page- 12 Clause- MSP Eligibility Criteria (Folder- ECDOCS), Clause 9 | CSP /Certified Vetted BoQ – Confirmation of the Services/ Resources being offered against each of the requirements are Equivalent or Higher Specifications and its public listed price against the same. This certification must be on CSP's letter head and from its authorized representative. | Kindly confirm if this would go as part of the technical bid basis the "Unpriced_BOQ" | To be submitted as part of Technical bid as per " Unpriced_BOQ" |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 21 | Page- 33 Clause-4.1.3 Undertaking by bidder on his/her/their Letter Head as per Annexure V: | Local Content | For local content, industry associations have submitted a representation on behalf of members seeking clarification on the Department of Promotion of Industry and Internal Trade Public Procurement Order 2017 (Make in India Order) for Cloud Service Providers and discussions are underway. In the absence of any clarification, if the data center is in India and also empanelled with the MEITY, then we request you to consider the services rendered from the same as local services for the purpose of minimum local content requirement of Class I. We have precendences of similar consideration from other Central and State Government entities in their recent public tenders for cloud procurement. Few examples include: (a) NTPC, Amendment to Tender no. NIT No: NTPC/EOC/9900228546 dated 30.11.2021. Rate contract for cloud services (b) IOCL, Tender No.: | NO change in bid clause and Tender conditions shall prevail. ( Cloud services being provided from CSPs Data centers located in India will be treated as local services for purpose of Minimum Local content |
| 22 | BOQ Excel Row 79  Item: Fully managed IoT Device Management service | Quantity Description: "Per thousand things registered per month" | Our understanding is the given quantity 10 implies, Ten thousand things registered per month. Kindly confirm. | Total Quantity is Ten Thousand Things Registered per Month |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 23 | Page 67  13.3.E - Exit Management Plan | The CSP/MSP shall carry out the migration of the VMs, data, content and any other assets to the new environment created by the Owner or any other Agency (on behalf of the Owner) on alternate cloud service provider's offerings to enable successful deployment and running of the Government Owner's solution on the new infrastructure. | Here our understanding is that new agency will be responsible for creation of similar environment for the restoration of application into their cloud and CSP/MSP will not be responsible for any non-compatibility of services/platform in new environment which may result in non-performance of application. kindly confirm if our understanding is correct. | MSP is to work with CIL to ensure successful deployment of Infrastructure for Exit Management. |
| 24 | Page- 74  Section IV: TECHNICAL SCOPE OF WORK MSP Scope of work | The Bidder will be responsible for provisioning of requisite network infrastructure and connectivity to ensure accessibility of the cloud servers / virtual machines/ Platform services as per defined SLAs. | Please clarify how will CIL connect to cloud i.e via Internet or over secured MPLS connection | Initial Connectivity will be over public internet and CIL will assess the need for dedicated connectivity later |
| 25 | Page- 75  Section IV: TECHNICAL SCOPE OF WORK Business Continuity Services (Disaster Recovery) | Backup needs shall be Determined per application and Shall have to be automated like the rest of the Infrastructure | Please clarify the RTO / RPO | Details of RTO AND RPO have been given in Onetime Implementation Section IV activity V |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 26 | Page- 76 Section IV: TECHNICAL SCOPE OF WORK I Provisioning and Setup of Cloud Services: | a) The MSP shall be responsible for migration of applications on Cloud & provisioning of required software, infrastructure, bandwidth, licenses and management of services deployment and hosting of the web application and the projects mentioned in the scope. | Please clarify what applications are to be migrated and also specify if they were tested to run on cloud environment | Details of Application have been given in Onetime Implementation Section IV activity V |
| 27 | Page- 9 Minimum Qualifying requirement (MQRDOCS) | Note: 1. "Similar Work" means: - "Implementation or provisioning of Cloud based infrastructure, which may include provision of Compute, Server Less Computing, Memory, VM, Block Storage, Object Storage, No SQL Databases, Relational Databases Services or Container Management Services, provision of Big Data Platform, Data Warehouse Services, Data Modelling and Visualization Services, API Gateway or Data Integration/Ingestion or AI/ML or IOT Services on Meity Empanelled Clouds | Note: 1. "Similar Work" means: - Implementation or provisioning of Cloud based infrastructure, which may include many/large part of the following : Provision of Compute, Server Less Computing, Memory, VM, Block Storage, Object Storage, No SQL Databases, Relational Databases Services or Container Management Services, provision of Big Data Platform, Data Warehouse Services, Data Modelling and Visualization Services, API Gateway or Data Integration/Ingestion or AI/ML or IOT Services on Meity Empanelled Clouds | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |

| 28 | Page- 8 Section-Minimum Qualifying requirement (MQRDOCS) Sr.No: 1 | Work Experience (refer clause 4.1.1 of Section II): Bidder should have experience of executing Similar Work during last 7 years (as on the due date of submission of the bid) as per the value given below: Three similar works each costing not less than the amount equal to 40% of the estimated cost put to tender. Or Two similar works each costing not less than the amount equal to 50% of the estimated cost put to tender. Or One similar work project costing not less than the amount equal to 80% of the estimated cost put to tender. | We request you to kindly modify the clause as "Work Experience (refer clause 4.1.1 of Section II): Bidder should have experience of executing Similar Work during last 7 years (as on the due date of submission of the bid) as per the value given below: Three similar works each costing not less than the amount equal to 40% of  annual value of the estimated cost put to tender. Or Two similar works each costing not less than the amount equal to 50% of  annual value of the estimated cost put to tender. Or One similar work project costing not less than the amount equal to 80% of annual value of the estimated cost put to tender. | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |

| 29 | Page- 9, 39 Section-Minimum Qualifying requirement (MQRDOCS) Sr.No: 1 | Note:<br>1. "Similar Work" means: - "Implementation or provisioning of Cloud based infrastructure, which may include provision of Compute, Server Less Computing, Memory, VM, Block Storage, Object Storage, No SQL Databases, Relational Databases Services or Container Management Services, provision of Big Data Platform, Data Warehouse Services, Data Modelling and Visualization Services, API Gateway or Data Integration/Ingestion or AI/ML or IOT Services on Meity Empanelled Clouds | Note:<br>1. "Similar Work" means: - "Implementation or provisioning of Cloud based infrastructure, which may include provision of Compute, Server Less Computing, Memory, VM, Block Storage, Object Storage, No SQL Databases, Relational Databases Services or Container Management Services, provision of Big Data Platform, Data Warehouse Services, Data Modelling and Visualization Services, API Gateway or Data Integration/Ingestion or AI/ML or IOT Services on any public or private Clouds | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 30 | Page- 35 Section-Technical Evaluation Criteria (TECDOCS) | Previous Experience-The Bidder should have similar Cloud Service Projects in the last three financial years.(i.e., from 01.04.2019 to the bid submission date) Worth minimum Rs. 3.0 Crore each<br><br>Executed on the offered Cloud 2 Marks for Each Project<br><br>Executed on other Meity Empanelled Cloud 0.5 Marks for Each Project | We request you to kindly modify the clause as below for better competition Previous Experience-The Bidder should have similar Cloud Service Projects in the last three financial years.(i.e., from 01.04.2019 to the bid submission date) Worth minimum Rs. 2.0 Crore each<br><br>Executed on the any Private or public Cloud 2 Marks for Each Project " | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |
| 31 | Page- 2 Section- Earnest Money Deposit (EMD) | Earnest Money Deposit (EMD) - (1.25% of the Annualized Estimated Cost of work put to tender, rounded off to next hundred subject to maximum of Rs.50 lacs) Rs 4,52,200/- | We request to allow EMD exemption for Medium category companies as well, with the valid MSME certificate. | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |
| 32 | Page- 60 Section- 9.0 TERMS & CONDITIONS OF PAYMENT | Payment Schedule: The payment against this contract shall be made on quarterly basis. The first quarterly bill for infrastructure for the period of service during 1st quarter, shall be raised at the end of 1st quarter after acceptance of infrastructure. | We request you to change the payment term as Monthly basis to avoid cash flow issues. | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 33 | Page- 74 Clause- MSP Scope of Work : Application Assessment | | What is the total number of applications and what is underlying technology stack of the applications that need to be assessed? | Details given in One Time Implementation- Future requirements cannot be envisaged |
| 34 | Page- 74 Clause- MSP Scope of Work : Application Assessment | | How would discovery (of app and infra) be done? Would it be manual or would CIL allow to run discovery tools to capture this data? | Details given in One Time Implementation |
| 35 | Page- 74 Clause- MSP Scope of Work : Application Assessment | | Please share details of application functionalities | Details given in One Time Implementation |
| 36 | Page- 74 Clause- MSP Scope of Work : Application Assessment | | Please share the existing deployment model details about the application deployed in on-prem data center. | Details given in One Time Implementation |
| 37 | Page- 74 Clause- MSP Scope of Work : Application Assessment | | Please share details about the application and database server | Details given in One Time Implementation |
| 38 | Page- 74 Clause- MSP Scope of Work : Application Criticality | | What is the criticality of these applications? Is there a List of applications with business criticality, technical stack, SLA and RTO RPO requirements? | RTO and RPO requirements are given in Onetime implementation |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 39 | Page-14 Clause- CSP MQR : Specification and Eligibility | | Google is in a process of getting Meity certification for his second data center-Delhi. They have received the SQTC Audit certificate for Delhi center. They shall get the Meity certificate soon. Thus, we request you to consider SQTC Audit certification or allow the later date of Meity certification for Delhi center for this RFP. | 2 or more data enters are to be MeitY empanelled as of Bid Submission End Date |
| 40 | Page-22 Clause CSP EC : IOT Hub / Gateway | | RFP says that the CSP should offer native service that allows connected devices to easily and securely interact with the cloud services / applications and other devices. Regarding IoT Services, Is it possible to use 3rd party IoT services on GCP as opposed to native IoT Services. | All services requested are to be CSP Native Services; |
| 41 | Page- BoQ Excel Clause  BoQ : VMs and Storages | | In the BoQ CIL has mentioned predefined size of VMs and Storages, in a hyperscale cloud you have the flexibility to go per core, per GB RAM and Per GB Hard disk. This will help CIL to get the most optimized TCO. | Sizing IS indicative, Approach would be automation for Scaling for optimizing TCO |
| 42 | Page- 37 Clause Instructions to Bidder : Technical Evaluation Criteria | | What will be the timeline to showcase Proof of Capability? | to be Showcased During Presentation |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **43** | | | | Please share the timeline considered for shifting applications to cloud ? | Initial Timeline has been given in One Time Implementation |
| **44** | Annexture VI | | | We understand that for PQC and in Technical qualification for credentials submission there is an ask to submit the Work orders. However, due to our NDAs with clients and for confidentiality reasons we won't be able to submit the Work orders. We would really appreciate if you can allow us to submit Self-certified credentials from our Country Head or CEO or equivalent authority and/or Independent CA certified credentials. | As per Annexure VI--Total Cost of the Project (as per work/purchase order) OR if not mentioned in work order, then all the invoice copies of the project till date OR the written signed copy from the client mentioning value of the project or Independent CA certification may be given |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 45 | Page-48 Clause-Procurement from Micro and Small Enterprises (MSEs) | 12.3 i)  Subject to meeting terms and conditions stated in the tender document including but not limiting to prequalification criteria, 25% of the work will be awarded to MSE as defined in MSE Procurement Policy issued by Department of Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises (MSME) for the tendered work/item. Where the tendered work can be split, MSE quoting a price within a price band of L1 + 15% shall be awarded at least 25% of total tendered work provided they match L1 price. In case the tendered work cannot be split, MSE shall be awarded full work provided their quoted price is within a price band of L1 + 15% and they match the L1 price. | We are the managed services provider of respective OEMs working on certain % margin, keeping MSE clause with L1+15% price preference will restrict the competetive bidders to participate. It is requested to remove MSE price preference clause. | Tender Conditions Prevail |
| 46 | Page- 19 Clause- CSP EC Container Management Platform | The CSP should offer highly  scalable and high- performance managed container service (e.g. Kubernetes), without installing and operating Kubernetes control plane manually. | Please let us know the used case for "without installing and operating Kubernetes control plane manually. " | CSP to offer hosted Kubernetes services that handles cluster management automatically. All Control Plane actions to be fully managed by CSP including version change , scalability, availability and etcd instances. |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 47 | Page- 50 Clause- Tendernotice_1 Domain Name Registration (DNS) Service | The CSP should provide a scalable and highly available DNS service. | Do CIL needs domain name registration. Usually domain name registration should come from customer as it is owned by customer, However Tata Communications will provide the DNS services through a partner. | CSP to offer a integrated DNS Service as a fully managed Cloud Native offering |
| 48 | Page- 57 Clause- Tendernotice_1 Distributed Denial of Service (DDoS) Protection | The CSP should offer protection against qualitative (nonvolumetric) and quantitative (volumetric) DDoS attacks. | Please share the throughput needed for both volumetric and non volumetric attack mitigation. For non volumetric attack mitigations will already be covered in WAF so requesting CIL to remove non volumetric DDOS requirement as WAF is already asked. | CSP Security Services should be capable of handling attacks both Qualitative and Quantitative. The Details of Attack campaigns shall be shared from Threat Intelligence Received by CIL through CERT-In or other sources. WAF and DDoS are for different protections. WAF is more at a Layer 7 while DDoS is at layers 3/4. specific rule sets  decided upon at a later stage. |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 49 | Page- 57 Clause- Tendernotice_1 Distributed Denial of Service (DDoS) Protection | The CSP should offer protection against qualitative (nonvolumetric) and quantitative (volumetric) DDoS attacks. | Most of the non volumetric application layer DDOS attacks are mitigated by WAF only. So requesting you to re evaluate the requirement of qualitative (non-volumetric)attack mitigation in DDOS servises. Please evaluate the same as there is a chance of optimization.You may mention OWASP Top 10 attack mitigation in WAF section which will take care of the same. Or Else you may mention what all qualitative (non- volumetric) attack mitigation is needed. | CSP Security Services should be capable of handling attacks both Qualitative and Quantitative. The Details of Attack campaigns shall be shared from Threat Intelligence Received by CIL through CERT-In or otther sources. WAF and DDoS are for different protections. WAF is more at a Layer 7 while DDoS is at layers 3/4. specific rule sets decided upon at a later stage. CSP to Showcase Capability for the same. |
| 50 | Page- 63 Clause- Tendernotice_1 SSL Certificates | The CSP should provide managed service to manage and provision SSL / TLS certificates. · CSP Should offer both Public and Private SSL Certificates(self or 3rd party) | More details required. Is the SSL certificate asked is for application or for domain? | CIL expects the CSP to provision public and private SSL/TLS certificates as needed. Depending on the necessary Controls both all communications to be encrypted and CSP to offer SSL Services self or 3rd party through CSP Consoles/APIs |
| 51 | Page- 21 Clause- CSP EC I/O support | The CSP should offer the needs of I/O-intensive workloads, particularly databases and production workloads. Note: It should be able to support more than 10,000 IOPS, if required. | IOPS is a function of amount os storage please mention howmuch IOPS you need per GB of storage so that right storage variant can be choosed. So please mention per GB howmuch IOPS is needed? | The actual Storage and IOPS requirement would be decided by CIL as per the use cases which will be identified at a later stage. Also, CIL does not want to be constrained by a situation where the requirement may be for smaller storage but higher IOPS. |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| **52** | Page- 26 Clause- CSP EC SSL Certificates | The CSP should provide managed service to manage and provision SSL / TLS certificates.<br>· CSP Should offer both Public and Private SSL Certificates(self or 3rd party | As SSL certificates are taken in the name of customer we request Coal India to procure the same. Bidder will support in implementation. | CIL expects the CSP to provision public and private SSL/TLS certificates as needed. Depending on the necessary Controls both all communications to be encrypted and CSP to offer SSL Services self or 3rd party through CSP Consoles/APIs |
| **53** | Page- 35 Clause- Tendernotice_1 TECDOCS | Organizational Standards MSP organization should be a<br>* CMMI level 3 -SVC or above - 5 Marks<br>* CMMI level 3 -DEV or above -5 Marks | We Request you moify as below: Organisational Standards MSP organization should be a CMMI level 3 -SVC or above - 10 Marks or CMMI level 3 -DEV or above -10 Mark | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |
| **54** | Page- 100 Clause- Tendernotice_1 Security breach including Data Theft/Loss/Corruptio n | Any incident where in system compromised or any case wherein data theft occurs (including internal incidents) | Requesting you to delete the clause as Security breach including data theft/loss/corruption – this requires security solutions like EDR/DLP/SIEM etc. if any infection is originated from customer then service provider shall not be held accountable. | Pertains only to Controls which are Implemented and Managed by MSP. |

| 55 | Page- 82 Clause-Tendernotice_1 Security Services | 2. Review all Security patches relevant to the IT environment and classify the need and speed in which the Security patches should be installed as defined by Security policies and Change Management Install Security patches per CIL .s Change Management process and procedures including acquiring required CIL . approval | Noted the required approvals from COAL india will be taken through email and not through ticketing system workflow. | Approval for Patches shall be required from CIL only where Application Dependency Dictates |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 56 | Page- 82 Clause-Tendernotice_1 Security Services | 7. Data Security consists of the activities associated with the classification, management, security, encryption of sensitive/confidential data and the storage of media containing that data.<br>8. Provide Data Security in conformance with policies, procedures and practices<br>9. Classify data under Service Providers control<br>11. Periodically review data security to ensure data is being protected consistently with data classification MSP shall ensure that existing policies and best practice relating to logical security of, but not limited to, shares, folders, operating systems and Data, are adhered to and are auditable. | This requires data classification solution and HDD encryption solution. However there is no line item in BOQ to consider pricing for the same.<br>Also confirm do they really need data classification solution and HDD encryption solution. | Policies regarding Classification are to be enforced by MSP where required. Technologies such as Disk encryption , Tagging are widely available with CSPs |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 57 | Page- 82 Clause-Tendernotice_1 Security Services | 12. Properly implementing anti-malware and host-based intrusion detection systems on their instances, as well as any required network-based intrusion detection systems in accordance with policies. | This needs HIPS/EDR/AV solutions. However there is no line item in BOQ to consider pricing for the same. | Bidder shall only provision Solutions offered by the CSP, Requirements for 3rd Party Tools shall be assessed by CIL. |
| 58 | Page- 82 Clause-Tendernotice_1 Security Services | point 13, 22, 27,28, 29 & 30 require SIEM solution. | This needs SIEM. However there is no line item in BOQ to consider pricing for the same. | Bidder shall only provision Solutions offered by the CSP, Requirements for 3rd Party Tools shall be assessed by CIL. |
| 59 | Page- 82 Clause-Tendernotice_1 Security Services | 23. MSP provides both Intrusion Detection/Prevention Services. MSP also performs internal threat monitoring for malicious and/or suspicious activity<br>24. Provide Intrusion Detection/Prevention Services and reporting<br>25. Allow for independent Intrusion Detection/Prevention Services provided by CIL . | This needs IPS/IDS solution. However there is no line item in BOQ to consider pricing for the same. | Bidder shall only provision Solutions offered by the CSP, Requirements for 3rd Party Tools shall be assessed by CIL. |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 60 | Page- 96 Clause- Tendernotice_1 5.10 Application of Penalty | vi. The penalty in percentage of the Monthly Payment is indicated against each SLA parameter in the table. For example: a. For SLA1 if the penalty to be levied is 7% then 7% of the Monthly Payment is deducted from the total of the Monthly Payment bill and the balance paid to the Service Provider. b. If the penalties are to be levied in more than one SLA, then the total applicable penalties are calculated and deducted from the total of the Monthly Payment bill and the balance paid to the Service Provider. SLA1 =7% of the Monthly Payment, SLA12=10% of the Monthly Payment, SLA19=2% of the Monthly Payment then Amount to be paid = Total Monthly bill – (19% of the Monthly Payment) | Please modify the SLA as per below parameters. Severity levels Response time Resolution time Severity 1 15 mins 4 hours Severity 2 15 mins 12 hours Severity 3 15 mins 24 hours | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |
| 61 | Page- 66 Clause- CSP EC Deployment and Management | The CSP should offer a service to deploy and manage applications in the cloud by allowing code repository, automating code deployment, capacity provisioning, load balancing, auto-scaling and application health monitoring. | Customer should share use case detailing applicati on deployment process to be automated and CICD work flow | CSP Service capability requirements have been given as :code repository, automating code deployment, capacity provisioning, load balancing, auto- scaling and application health monitoring, shall be used as per requirements of CIL from Time to time |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 62 | Page- 75 Clause- CSP EC On-Premise Integration | The CSP should allow import of VMs from a virtualization environment such as Citrix Xen, Microsoft HyperV, Vmware vSphere, etc | Is their plan to migrate workload from on-premises to public cloud | Some On-premisis Workloads will be migrated in addition to the Corporate Website |
| 63 | Page- 48 Clause- 9.0 User Portal Agreement | 9.0 User Portal Agreement | Bidder Proposes that all terms and condition of the tender and the user portal agreement to be read with the deviations submitted by the bidder herein and afterwards. | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |
| 64 | Page- 59 Clause- 25.0 Applicable Law and Jurisdiction: | 25.0 Applicable Law and Jurisdiction: | Bidder Proposes that the the Parties hereby agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the courts in Mumbai only | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |
| 65 | Page- 63 Clause- Section III Conditions of Contract 8.0 SETTLEMENT OF DISPUTES | 8.0 SETTLEMENT OF DISPUTES | Bidder Proposes that the Arbitrator u/s 8.4.2 to be mutually appointed by the parties. | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |
| 66 | Page- 66 Clause- Section III Conditions of Contract 10.0 Liquidated Damages (LD) for delay in Commencement | 10.0 Liquidated Damages (LD) for delay in Commencement | Bidder proposes to withdraw levy of LD on this contract | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 67 | Page- 69 Clause- Section III Conditions of Contract 13 Foreclosure, Termination, Exit Management Plan and Continuation of Part Services: | 13 Foreclosure, Termination, Exit Management Plan and Continuation of Part Services: | If owner cancels any of the Services for any reason other than for default of the bidder, then the owner agrees to pay to Supplier, within ten (10) days of such termination esrly termination charges as mutually agreed between the parties alongwith charges for Services delivered to Customer up to the date of termination | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |
| 68 | Page- 74 Clause- Section III Conditions of Contract 15.0 Limitation of Liability of Agency | 15.0 Limitation of Liability of Agency | Bidder proposes below clause to be read with limitation of Liability' Notwithstanding anything contained in the RFP the Bidder shall in no event be liable in an amount that exceeds, in the aggregate for all such liabilities, the most recent twelve (12) months of charges collected by the bidder from the bank immediately preceding the day giving rise to the liability. | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |

| 69 | Page- 75 Clause- Section III Conditions of Contract 20. Intellectual property rights (IPR) | 20. Intellectual property rights (IPR) | Owner is and shall remain exclusively entitled to all right and interest in and to all owner Technology, and Bidder is and shall remain exclusively entitled to all right and interest in and to all bidder Technology. Owner shall not, directly or indirectly, reverse engineer, de-compile, disassemble or otherwise attempt to derive source code or other trade secrets from Bidder Technology. Ownership of any and all intellectual property rights in any bidder', software, operating manuals and associated documentation, made available as part of any Service or otherwise generated by or for bidder in connection with this Agreement, shall remain the property of Supplier or its licensors. Bidder will grant the owner a personal, non-transferable and non- exclusive license to use and to permit its End-Users to use, in object code form, all software and associated written | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| **70** | Page- 48 Section- 6.3 Clause- 1 | It is mandatory for bidder to quote a single discount percentage on the CSP Total List pricing and Coal India will use the same discount percentage to avail any of the CSP services, including list of services beyond ones provided in the BoQ | Request if the percentage discount amount can be limited to the items specified in the BoQ only as estimations on items outside the BoQ cannot be performed and constitutes a significant financial risk. | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |
| **71** | Page- 25 Section- Clause- 51 | Content Delivery Network (CDN)  - Should Support Running Serverless Computing at Edge Locations | Request removal of this criteria as this is limiting to single CSP provider | Not Relevant |
| **72** | Page- 35 Section- Clause- 1 | Previous ExperienceThe Bidder should have similar Cloud Service Projects in the last three financial years.(i.e., from 01.04.2019 to the bid submission date) Worth minimum Rs. 3.0 Crore each Executed on the offered Cloud 2 Marks for Each Project | Request if the projects can be considered on Private cloud environment also as part of this evaluation | Projects have to be executed on MeitY Empanelled Clouds. |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 73 | Page- 74 Section-Clause- 1 | The Bidder will be responsible for provisioning of required cloud infrastructure and services as listed in the Bill of quantity based on Coal India's requirement from time to time. The Bidder will examine the application landscape that needs to be hosted on cloud infrastructure. This activity may enable the Bidder to gauge the application workload requirements before provisioning the respective cloud infrastructure/Services. | Please clarify if the MSP will be part of the design process and will be able to provide inputs on the architecture? or Will the MSP be provided with the architecture and SOP's as required by CIL to implement as per the design? | Design of the Architecture shall be jointly undertaken by MSP, CIL and or its nominated Agencies or Consultants |
| 74 | Page- 74 Section-Clause- 10 | The cloud infrastructure / service provisioned by the Bidder must be scalable and flexible. Coal India shall be able to add/reduce cloud infrastructure / services on demand basis. | Please clarify if the resource provisining authority would be directly allocated to CIL teams or will be through MSP as part of a provisioning,configuration or capacity augmentation process to be defined.<br><br>It is recommended that CIL teams to follow a support ticket process with the MSP for these activities | Resource Provisioning Authority shall be shared with CIL teams and audit trails for all actions are to be enabled |

| 75 | Page- 74 Section- Clause- 12 | Upgrades: Any required version / software / hardware upgrades, patch management etc. provided by the Bidder / CSP will be managed by the Bidder for the entire contract period at no extra cost to Coal India. Bidder to consult / inform Coal India before doing any upgrade and share detailed report of associated services / functionalities which may get impacted due to the upgrade. | Please clarify these upgrades will only be limited to CSP platform as managed by the MSP. Any upgrade dependency on CIL Application and Middleware will remain out of scope | Upgrades shall be considered in scope if provided supported by the CSP through CSP Channels. CIL Application and Middleware will remain out of scope |

| 76 | Page- 76 Section- Clause- a | The MSP shall be responsible for migration of applications on Cloud & provisioning of required software, infrastructure, bandwidth, licenses and management of services deployment and hosting of the web application and the projects mentioned in the scope. It will be required to adequately and optimally size the necessary compute, memory, storage and platform services, to build the minimum sufficient redundancy into the architecture (including storage) and load balancing to meet the service levels mentioned in the RFP at all times. The hosting solution must be designed for rapid elasticity and handle hardware failures without downtime. In addition to the production environment, the MSP shall also provision for the test and development environments on the cloud. | Request clarification if for the migration and load testing phase CIL will accommodate the pre-requisites from the MSP including but not limited to:<br>- Access to architecture and SOP's<br>- Migration assesment study and access to application stakeholders<br>- Existing environment details including infra and support issues<br>- Prototyping and Load testing on the target environment<br>- Shadow period with support from existing teams and relaxed SLA's | has already been given in RFP Page 80 |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 77 | Page- 76 Section- Clause- b | The hosted solution is required to be a multi-site deployment, across geographically disparate sites, with Active-Active configuration to ensure fault-tolerance and therefore, provide business continuity. In case of failure, automated processes should shift application traffic to the redundant hosts. | Please clarify if the DR site is required to be Active-Active (RPO=0 and RTO = 0) or Active-Passive | Details have been given in One Time Implementation |
| 78 | Page- 89 Section- Clause- 13 | RTO and RPO for DR would be 30 minutes and 15 Min | | Details have been given in One Time Implementation |
| 79 | Page- 79 Section- Clause- a | Successful Bidder to ensure that the Landing cloud infrastructure(CIDR for Network will be shared by CIL) for the application is deployed within 15 days of award of the contract. | Please clarify the implementation timelines as required for the systems. | Landing Zone, Initial Networks, subnets are to be created and  Access Keys for Infrastructure are to be Shared with CIL within 15 days. |
| 80 | Page- 89 Section- Clause- V | One Time Implementation Time line for the above delivery is WO(Work Order + 45 Days) | | One Time Implementation is to be Done within 45 Days |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 81 | Page- 76 Section- Section IV Clause- b | While the initial sizing & provisioning of the underlying infrastructure may be carried out based on the information provided in the RFP, subsequently, it is expected that the MSP, based on the growth in the user load (peak and non-peak periods; year-on-year increase), will scale up or scale down the compute, memory, and storage as per the performance requirements of the solution and meet the SLAs using the auto-scaling features provided by the CSP | Is bidder suppose to do any kind of workload assessment for sizing purpose or the one provided in the BOQ only need to be considered. | Sizing Decisions shall be taken after Assessment and shall be done on a Per Application basis. Refer to Page 80 |
| 82 | Page- 74 Section- Section IV Clause- 1 | The Bidder will be responsible for provisioning of required cloud infrastructure and services as listed in the Bill of quantity based on Coal India's requirement from time to time. The Bidder will examine the application landscape that needs to be hosted on cloud infrastructure. This activity may enable the Bidder to gauge the application workload requirements before provisioning the respective cloud infrastructure/Services. | Since in one of the RFP clause, its mentioned to bid as per the initial sizing provided  - Is bidder still required to do any kind of application assessment.? If Yes, will the bidder be allowed to deploy any assessment tool or will be provided with the inventory along with utilisation details to carry out the assessment.? Kinldly provide the application architecture to understand the application workflow. | Sizing Decisions shall be taken after Assessment and shall be done on a Per Application basis. Refer to Page 80 |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 83 | Page- 74 Section- Section IV Clause- 3 | Bidder can only supply services from one cloud service provider (CSP) during the entire tenure of the contract. Split services from different CSPs are not allowed. The bidder shall not be permitted to subcontract its obligations under the contract. | If there is any third party tool chosen like Perimeter Firewall or Backup or VA as part of the solution design & One Time deployment for the same is done via OEM or partner - will that be allowed.? Kindly clarify | Bidder shall only provision Solutions offered by the CSP, Requirements for 3rd Party Tools shall be assessed by CIL. |
| 84 | Page- 74 Section- Section IV Clause- 5 | The Bidder shall support the respective application teams for deployment Coal India's projects mentioned, on the cloud infrastructure. | Its assumed that the support to application team will be limited from Infra standpoint only & any application configuration/ deployment will be app owner's responsibility. Kindly clarify the support expectations & scope from bidder | Bidder shall be responsible for Troubleshooting / Maintaining Services provided natively by CSP Including IaaS , PaaS and SaaS. |
| 85 | Page- 75 Section- Section IV Clause- 19 | All code delivery shall undergo quality assurance (QA) testing, ISO 27001 Standard Compliance testing and any procedures and policies outlined by CIL or Govt of India as necessary, and comprehensive documentation should be maintained for the same. | Bidder to provide the infra for storing the code & keeping it secure. QA testing of the code will fall under CIL scope. Is the expectations in line or different from bidder. | Code Delivery - Refers to Infrastructure as Code which shall be developed by MSP and has to undergo QA Testing by MSP before delivery . |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 86 | Page- 75 Section- Section IV Clause- 23 | Onsite resource will be responsible for cloud infrastructure / service deployment, migration, coordination with application stakeholders, specific troubleshooting or other planning tasks etc. required by Coal India. | CIL has asked for one onsite resource -  is there a specific time period for which the resource will be deployed (like until migration or Cloud Infra provisioning) or is this resource will be permanent on CIL payrolls and will be responsible for the management of Cloud services for the contract term.? | Resource Shall be a full time deployment at CIL HQ, and will have Responsibilities mentioned in the Scope. |
| 87 | Page- 75 Section- Section IV Clause- 20 | All Infrastructure code should be version controlled, and tools should be deployed for Drift Detection from the latest Version of Code | Is Drift detection needed for manual changes from outside the IaC code or all the changes including IaC code ? What is the current tool being used for IaC and CICD ? | Drift Detection is to be enabled for Drift from the Current Master Branch of the Production IAC. There are no current IaC Tools and CICD is not currently deployed |
| 88 | Page- 75 Section- Section IV Clause- 21 | Continuous Integration/Continuous Deployment (CI/CD) to be achieved for Infrastructure code with automated testing and Deployment from Dev to Staging and Production | What parameters/scenarios need to be considered when doing automated testing for permitted instances before replication from DEV to Prod using CI/CD ? | Depends on per application basis and will be mutually decided |
| 89 | Page- 76 Section- Section IV Clause- IV | Scope for Maintenance and troubleshooting of Applications | Cloud Infra hosting & managed services is bidder's responsibility. Is bidder also expected to manage the Application and responsible for its maintenance.? | There would be Separate teams for Application Maintenance |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 90 | Page- 76 Section- Section IV Clause- a | The MSP shall be responsible for migration of applications on Cloud & provisioning of required software, infrastructure, bandwidth, licenses and management of services deployment and hosting of the web application and the projects mentioned in the scope. It will be required to adequately and optimally size the necessary compute, memory, storage and platform services, to build the minimum sufficient redundancy into the architecture (including storage) and load balancing to meet the service levels mentioned in the RFP at all times. The hosting solution must be designed for rapid elasticity and handle hardware failures without downtime. In addition to the production environment, the MSP shall also provision for the test and development environments on the cloud. | Kindly clarify on the migration scope. Is bidder expected to do any app or data migration from on premise to cloud. If Yes, help us with the application landscape/ architecture, workload distribution, data size in GB or TB, connectivity option to carry out migration activity. | Current State for Ontime application has been given in Section IV One Time Implementation |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 91 | Page- 76 Section- Section IV Clause- b | The hosted solution is required to be a multi-site deployment, across geographically disparate sites, with Active-Active configuration to ensure fault-tolerance and therefore, provide business continuity. In case of failure, automated processes should shift application traffic to the redundant hosts | Is multi-site deployment required from DC and DR standpoint.? If Yes, is the requirement to provide Active-Active DC and DR or Active-Passive in 2 different regions seperated by geography. If Active-Active, does your application support such kind of a deployment where multi write to DB across regions happen | Applications supports multi write |
| 92 | Page- 78 Section- Section IV Clause- e | Conducting regular vulnerability scanning and penetration testing of the systems, as mandated by COAL INDIAs policies using CSP Tools if available. | Frequency of VA/ PT to be conducted and systems involved | Schedule is yet to be determined |
| 93 | Page- 102 Section- 5.1 Clause- 17 | Managed Services Scope - Backup & Adherence to backup policy | Backup policy required for backup estimation - 1. CI Count with OS & DB/Application Details 2. Type of backup - Snapshot / Filesystem / DB-App Aware 3. Retention, Frequency & window of backup 4. Current data size & estimated data growth (%) 5. Backup Target - Tapes / Disk / Cloud or a combination | Schedule is yet to be determined; would have to be automated |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 94 | Page- 78 Section- Section IV Clause- g | Bidder should provide the Management console to monitor the security events, real time traffic monitoring, Real time troubleshooting. | Is Bidder expected to provide SOC services for Security incidents response or CIL team will own it up.? If it falls in bidder's scope, SIEM or equivalent tool need to be factored and integration with ITSM tool will be required. Kindly help us with daily logs ingestion volume in EPS or GB | 3rd party tools shall be procured by CIL as per requirement. If CSP native services are available they shall be in scope as per RFP Terms |
| 95 | Page- 78 Section- Section IV Clause- a | Monitoring Performance and Service Levels Provide and implement tools and processes for monitoring the availability of assigned applications | Kindly clarify the scope from expectations perspective to monitor the application | Bidder to enable CIL application teams to use CSP Monitoring Services to monitor applications and When Application Specific Logs are Ingested into CSP Monitoring Services Alerts are to be configured for Errors and OS Level Errors |
| 96 | Page- 76 Section- Section IV Clause- a | Provisioning and Setup of Cloud Services: In addition to the production environment, the MSP shall also provision for the test and development environments on the cloud. | Sizing for the Test & Development environment requested. The Unpriced BOQ shared does not have the breakup for Prod, Test & Dev setup | As the requirements for Dev and Test cannot be determined upfront a Single Discount rate is being discovered for pay- as- you go use |
| 97 | Page- 20 Section- CSP MQ Clause- 11 | Managed NoSQL Service | We want to understand more on Nosql(open source) requirement | No SQL will be utilized by CIL internal Teams or its Authorized Vendors. Bidder shall be responsible only for Provision and Troubleshooting |
| 98 | Page- 20 Section- CSP MQ Clause- 14 | The CSP should offer fully managed native data integration / pipeline services | RFP mentions about orchestration using Apache workflow, need clarity on the same, where will this be required | Apache Workflow will be utilized by CIL internal Teams or its Authorized Vendors. Bidder shall be responsible only for Provision and Troubleshooting |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 99 | Page- 20 Section- Analytics & IOT Clause- 12 | The CSP should provide fully managed big data analytics platform (based on Apache Spark) for processing and analysing vast amounts of data offered as a native cloud service | are all the Big Data stacks Spark, Flink, Hbase, Hive, Presto, Zookeeper needed on single cluster or can have different cluster and these stacks on it.. | Big Data Platform will be utilized by CIL internal Teams or its Authorized Vendors. Bidder shall be responsible only for Provision and Troubleshooting |
| 100 | Page- 19 Section- Compute Services Clause- 10 | The CSP should provide/support of relational database services MySQL, PostGreSQL, Maria DB, MS SQL, as as a native cloud service enabling handling of routine database tasks such as provisioning,read replica, synchronous replication to secondary instance, patching, backup, recovery, failure detection and automatic switch over on same DNS endpoint, and repair etc.Databases services should be natively managed by CSP | Need more details on backups, retention,Database current size, growth per month/year,storage type,compute types required,current cpu/memory utilizations | Backup needs shall be Determined per application and Shall have to be automated like the rest of the Infrastructure.  CSP Resources shall be used for the Backup . |
| 101 | Page- 15 Section- Security Administration Clause- 2 | The MSP need to propose the methodology of defining the framework for ISO 27018 standard, develop required processes and procedures and implement for the proposed environments | Assuming the certification is applicable for cloud services, as delivered through this RFP, please confirm | If Data Classification tags are added to resources , Controls for Protection of PII Data are to be implemented by MSP |
| 102 | Page- 75 Section- MSP Scope of work Clause- 30 | Unless otherwise mentioned, backup recovery / restoration time for applications will be as per RPO. | Is the DR plan in place for the applications? Is there an DR automation solution in place? | DR Automation Tools Provided Natively By CSP Shall be Used for Automation. |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 103 | Page- 81 Section- Section IV Clause- | Database | Structured or unstructured DB, current DB size, Application connection with DB, current RTO and RPO for DB availabity over DR. tools being for reporting at the moment. | Databases will be utilized by CIL internal Teams or its Authorized Vendors. Bidder shall be responsible only for Provision and Troubleshooting |
| 104 | Page- 20 Section- Section IV Clause- 17 | The CSP should offer fully managed native service that allows connected devices to easily and securely interact with the cloud services / applications and other devices | What type of edge device are used in current setup. How many factories/manufacturing units are availble ate the moment. What kind of devices are communcating to edge devices. Is real time data anlyzed?, what is data store procedure ? , existing design with all components invoved | IoT and always connected Devices will be utilized by CIL internal Teams or its Authorized Vendors. Bidders are responsible only for  Troubleshooting CSP Related Issues |
| 105 | Page- 20 Section- Section IV Clause- 17 | The CSP should offer fully managed native service that allows connected devices to easily and securely interact with the cloud services / applications and other devices | What are the number of nested edge devices (Poka, Thingworx ) being used and specify them? What are the smart devices (sensors. robots, drones etc) communicating with nested edge devices? Are the orders (procurememt) automated? What are the Machine Learning usecases with the existing design? | IoT and always connected Devices will be utilized by CIL internal Teams or its Authorized Vendors. only for Troubleshooting CSP Related Issues |
| 106 | Page- 78 Section- Section IV Clause- e. Security Administration | Conducting regular vulnerability scanning and penetration testing of the systems, as mandated by COAL INDIAs policies using CSP Tools if available. | Frequency of VA/ PT to be conducted and systems involved | Operational Issue ; further details cannot be envisaged |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 107 | Page- 78 Section- Section IV Clause- f. Security Administration | Bidder should provide the Management console to monitor the security events, real time traffic monitoring, Real time troubleshooting. | Is Bidder expected to provide SOC services for Security incidents response or CIL team will own it up.? If it falls in bidder's scope, SIEM or equivalent tool need to be factored and integration with ITSM tool will be required. Kindly help us with daily logs ingestion volume in EPS or GB | Services of CSP shall be utilized as is; where necessary need for 3rd party tools shall be assessed by CIL. |
| 108 | Page- 78 Section- Section IV Clause- h. Security Administration | The MSP is required to provide an approach/methodology of the ISO 27001 ISMS,ISO 20000 standards,implement for the proposed solution under the RFP response and manage the same on an on-going basis | Assuming the certification is applicable for cloud services, as delivered through this RFP, please confirm | Methodology is to be given for services to be delivered by MSP to CIL under this RFP |
| 109 | Page- 82 Section- III Managed Services Scope Per Technology Component Clause- Security Services | Incident Reporting. | Do you require to undertake in-depth investigations following a cyber security event or incident? | Incident Response Plans to be developed as per Annex A.16.1 of ISO 27001:2013 |
| 110 | Page- 80 Section- II Operations & Maintenance with optimization of cloud services Clause- Miscellaneous | Bidder shall also be able to meet the any new security requirements as specified by Coal India auditor during the period of the contract | Request you to provide further clarity on the type of security requirements envisaged by CIL, for the CSP to account for potential effort required? | Services of CSP shall be utilized as is; where necessary need for 3rd party tools shall be assessed by CIL. |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 111 | Page- 100 Section- 5.10 Application of Penalty Clause- Vulnerability Management | For each breach/data theft, penalty will be levied as per following criteria. Any security incident detected INR 5 Lakhs. This penalty is applicable per incident. These Penalties will not be part | The CSP should be held for service deliverable and SLA and the right security assurances. For claim related to security and data breach this has to be chanalised through Cyber Insurance (No Security Operation can run security incident free) | For Controls which have been delegated to MSP the Penalties shall be applicable |
| 112 | Page- 19 Section- Database Clause- | Fully Managed Relational Database Services - MySQL, PostGreSQL, Maria DB, MS SQL, as as a native cloud | 1.What is the database version required 2.Sizing of compute reqired 3.How much of storage required 4.Frequency for backups | Databases will be utilized by CIL internal Teams or its Authorized Vendors. Bidder shall be responsible only for Provision and Troubleshooting |
| 113 | Page- 20 Section- Database Clause- | Managed NoSQL Service -The CSP should offer managed NoSQL database service provided as a native cloud service | 1.Type/Format of data to be stored in Nosql(CosmosDB) 2.Is there any need of multiregion deployment of cosmosDB. 3.Is there any requirement for multiregion write. 4.What is the Sizing requirement/Details | Databases will be utilized by CIL internal Teams or its Authorized Vendors. Bidder shall be responsible only for Provision and Troubleshooting |
| 114 | Page- 20 Section- Database Clause- | Data Modelling & Visualization -The CSP should offer fully managed data modelling and visualization service | Recommend to use powerBI in Azure Cloud Enviroment | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |
| 115 | Page- 20 Section- Database Clause- | Data Warehouse Service-The CSP should provide fully managed data warehouse capabilities offered as a cloud native services | What is the compute and storage requirement | Details have been given in the BoQ |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 116 | Page- 67 Section- 13.3 Clause- E | The CSP/MSP is responsible for both Transitions of the Services as well as Migration of the VMs, Data, Content and other assets to the new environment. | What would be the scope of Data Migration as its tightly couple with application. | CSP/MSP to work with CIL Application Teams for Migrations |
| 117 | Page- 73 Section- IV , Technical Scope of Work Clause- 1 | 1 Full time onsite engineer | As this is a cloud Enviroment and hosted in CSP enviroment, can this resource be a dedicated resource sitting at MSP delivery center. | No change tender conditions prevail |
| 118 | Page- 98 Section- 5.10 Application of Penalty Clause- vii - 6 | For Severity 1, 98% of the incidents should be resolved within 30 minutes of problem reporting | Severity 1 to be resolved within 2 hours, as 30min is too short time for resolving. | No change tender conditions prevail |
| 119 | Page- 101 Section- 5.10 Application of Penalty Clause- 16 | Two Drills once every 6 months) in a year (based on successful operations from the DR site and restoring services | Pls share the application landscape and its architecure along with which all application, resources would be part of DR. Also the RFP dosen't specify the DR landscape and DR Requriement | DR Automation Tools Provided Natively By CSP Shall be Used for Automation. |
| 120 | Page- 28 Section- Cloud Service Monitoring Dashboard  Clause- 79 | The CSP should offer monitoring dashboard depicting the availability and performance of cloud resources / services. | Is there expectation to have inbuilt monitoring solution or any other preferrence is there? | Only CSP Native Monitoring Services to be utilized |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 121 | Page- 28 Section- Audit Trail Clause- 80 | The CSP should offer Audit Trail feature for account activities to enable security analysis, resource change tracking, and compliance auditing. | Period of data is expected | Operational Issue ; further details cannot be envisaged |
| 122 | Page- 29 Section- Cloud Advisor Clause- 82 | The CSP should offer a service acts like a customized cloud expert and helps provision resources by following best practices. | Is there any specialized instruction on best price | Services to be Offered by CSP for Optimization of Usage |
| 123 | Page- 27 Section- Automated VM import functionality Clause- 75 | The CSP should allow import of VMs from a virtualization environment such as Citrix Xen, Microsoft HyperV, VMware vSphere, etc | Is there any expected numbers to onboard over period of time | Operational Issue ; further details cannot be envisaged |
| 124 | Page- 89 Section- v One time implementation Clause- | Implementation and tehnical details for Django app | Please clarify if the scope of MSP will be limited to infrastruture only? All implementation and configuration SOP's will be provided by app team? | for One Time Implementation the Entire scope as outlined is in scope for the MSP including Application Configuration. The Technology Stack is Open source |
| 125 | Page- 52 Section- II Clause- 21 | Prevention of Fraud and Corruption | Considering that we are a corporate entity, the conflict of interest clause is too broad. Kindly clarify what is the compliance expected with respect to relationship and also request you to restrict the point related to relationship only to the employees involved in preparation and submission of the tender response. | No change; current terms are broad and applicable across CIL |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 126 | Page- 58 Section- III Clause- 8 | SETTLEMENT OF DISPUTES | Request you to mention a representative from the bidder as well in order to ensure amicable settlement of disputes. Also, We suggest that the arbitrators to be chosen through a mutual arbitration process. | No change; current terms are broad and applicable across CIL |
| 127 | Page- 64 Section- III Clause- 13.1 | Foreclosure of Contract in full or part | We understand that the books of accounts will be limited to the invoices related to the project itself and will not involve the general book of accounts. | Will involve only the Project(s) under this RFP |
| 128 | Page- 65 Section- III Clause- 13.2(ii) | | Since there are already penalties related to non completion of projects as per the time line, request you to delete the clause related to 13.2(v) on payment of excess cost. Also, request you to update the clause references. | shall be invoked in case MSP Defaults on providing Exit Management services under the Contract |
| 129 | Page- 69 Section- III Clause- 15 (b) | Limitation of Liability of Agency | The liability cap refers to the total contract value plus escalation. Kindly clarify the reference to this escalation. | The liability cap refers to the total contract value plus escalation if any. |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 130 | Page- 113 Section- Clause- Annexure V | PROFORMA FOR UNDERTAKING | Considering that we are a corporate entity, it is difficult for us to confirm the relationship stated in the annexure. Request you to restrict the point related to relationship only to the employees who are involved in the preparation and submission of the response of the RFP. | No change; current terms are broad and applicable across CIL |
| 131 | Page- page no: 35, point 3 Section- Technical Evaluation Criteria (TECDOCS) | Organisational Standards MSP organization should be a CMMI level 3 -SVC or above - 5 Marks CMMI level 3 -DEV or above -5 Marks. | We request you to relax this clause of CMMI level 3, as it is not relevant with MSP service providers. Since, MSPs are only reselling & servicing CSPs (AWS) products. | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |
| 132 | Page 36, 37 & 38 Section 4.2 Eligibility Criteria (EC) and Technical Evaluation Criteria: | S No. 5, 6, & 7 | We request the technical presentations be allowed to be submitted one day prior to the date on which the technical presentation is scheduled. | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |
| 133 | Page page no. 76, Section Section IV- Technical Scope of work | Provisioning and Setup of cloud services 30b | Hope the application is multi-node compatible, please confirm? | Application stack is Wagtail CMS on Django. The stack is open source and all Single Points of failure are to be eliminated |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 134 | Page page no. 76 Section Section IV-Technical Scope of work | Provisioning and Setup of cloud services 30c | Generally capacity planning is being done by application vendors or developers, as MSP/ infrastructure team is not aware of application designing and minimum resource requirement of an application. Hence, it is requested to change the clause or ask as "MSP to support, capacity planning which will be carried out by application team" | Capacity planning for Projects would be done through mutual Discussions between application details and MSP as needed. MSP to Support Applications teams in setting up automation |
| 135 | Page page no. 78 Section Section IV-Technical Scope of work | Security Administration (f) | Cloud native audit trail service can provide the logs of Cloud and its resources access details.   Is CIL looking for OS level unauthorised access audit logs as well? If yes then 3rd party tool needs to be used whereas there is no 3rd party component cost header available in BOQ. | CSP Monitoring services should be capable of ingesting logs from various sources including OS level logs. MSP Shall be required to configure the same as needed. |
| 136 | Page page no. 83 Section Section IV-Technical Scope of work | III Managed Services Scope Per Technology Component Security Services (21) | Cloud native audit trail service can provide the logs of Cloud and its resources access details.   Is CIL looking for OS level unauthorised access audit logs as well? If yes then 3rd party tool needs to be used whereas there is no 3rd party component cost header available in BOQ. | CSP Monitoring services should be capable of ingesting logs from various sources including OS level logs. MSP Shall be required to configure the same as needed. |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 137 | Page page no. 79 Section Section IV-Technical Scope of work | Support for third party audits and Compliance  (b) | Where to add 3rd party tool cost, in this case penetration testing cost | 3rd party tools shall be procured by CIL as per requirement. If CSP native services are available they shall be in scope as per RFP Terms |
| 138 | Page page no. 79 Section Section IV-Technical Scope of work | Support for third party audits and Compliance  € | Cloud native solution is available, but the required cloud native component in not listed in BoQ, hence please suggest where to add the cost. | BoQ is indicative workload and additional services shall be utilized at CSP List Prices and Discount Given |
| 139 | Page page no. 81 Section Section IV-Technical Scope of work | Managed Services Scope Per Technology Component (Database) - c | is CIL looking for DBA from infrastructure prospective, hope application DBA (performance tuning, query tuning etc. related to application will be taken care by CIL or application vendor | All Deliverables are In scope as outlined in the RFP. |
| 140 | Page page no. 82 Section Section IV-Technical Scope of work | III Managed Services Scope Per Technology Component Security Services (12), (35) | is it the requirement of HIDS on VMs, if yes then its 3rd party, where to add the cost of the same? | 3rd party tools shall be procured by CIL as per requirement. If CSP native services are available they shall be in scope as per RFP Terms |
| 141 | Page  Section "Unpriced BOQ"-Analytics | ETL, fully managed: ETL platform should be able to support scheduling of jobs internally as well as provide support for workflow orchestration using Apache Workflow or Open Source options and should support connectors for multiple databases. | Hope you are referring to Apache Airflow, also please specify the open source options you are looking for accordingly we will check the support | Bidders may consider Apache Airflow Compatibility as necessary |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 142 | Page Section "Unpriced BOQ"- Analytics | Serverless Query Service | Please specify the desired data source on which requested query service expected to run. Assuming Redshift as the datasource , we can leverage Redshift serverless. | Should be capable of Querying Various Data Sources; bidders to depend on CSP for Optimal Solution |
| 143 | Page Section "Unpriced BOQ"- Machine Learning & IOT | Data Forecasting: Number of Generated forecasts 1000, 20 GB of data , 10 training hours per month | Is it a time series data, please confirm | Not relevant |
| 144 | Page Section "Unpriced BOQ"- Machine Learning & IOT | Fully managed IoT Device Management service to track, monitor and manage connected: Billed separately for the number of devices registered | What kind of devices are we using for this application. Does it support online mode or offline mode? | Bidders to Quote as per requirements as described; Specifications of the Devices shall be shared with the L1 Bidder |
| 145 | Page Page no - 89 Section V - One Time Implementation | 13) RTO and RPO for DR would be 30 minutes and 15 Min | RPO & RTO are mentioned but in the unpriced BOQ there is no such ask. Please clarify is this ask for DR as well. | RTP and RPO as given in One Time Implementation are achievable with the BoQ Items |
| 146 | Page- 8 Section- Minimum Qualifying requirement (MQRDOCS) S. No -1 | Similar Work Experience | Wynk Music (Airtel Digital Limited) is a commercial music app which operates on AWS Platform and extensively uses all its advance services. Same engineering team that namages Wynk is involved in operation and Support for AWS (Cloud) customers. Hence request to allow same as Similar Experiece. ADL is 100% subsudiary of Bharti Airtle Limited. | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 147 | Page- 11 Section- MSP Eligibility Criteria (Folder-ECDOCS) | Bidder should have at least 10 No of IT Professionals certified by the Offered CSP on their payrolls as on 30 days before the bid submission date. These professionals must have experience in maintenance of CSP cloud solution/ virtual server. administration/ system administration, Virtualization, security, database administration etc , The bidder should have the following resources on their payroll | Request department to kindly consider clause as mentioned below "Bidder should have at least 5 No of IT Professionals certified by the Offered CSP on their payrolls/offroll/subsidiary/sister company as on 30 days before the bid submission date." | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |
| 148 | Page- 35 Section- 4.2 Eligibility Criteria (EC) and Technical Evaluation Criteria: | Organisational Standards MSP organization should be a CMMI level 3 -SVC or above - 5 Marks CMMI level 3 -DEV or above -5 Marks | Requested to please change the clause as below<br><br>MSP(Bidder) organization should be having any of the below Organizational standards CMMI level 3 -SVC or above - 10 Marks / CMMI level 3 -DEV or above - 10Marks | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| **149** | Page- 35 Section- 4.2 Eligibility Criteria (EC) and Technical Evaluation Criteria: | Previous Experience-<br>The Bidder should have similar Cloud Service Projects in the last three financial years.(i.e., from 01.04.2019 to the bid submission date) Worth minimum Rs. 3.0 Crore each<br>Executed on the offered Cloud<br>2 Marks for Each Project | Request department to kindly consider clause as mentioned below<br>Previous Experience- The Bidder should have similar Cloud Service Projects in the last three financial years.(i.e., from 01.04.2019 to the bid submission date)<br>Worth minimum Rs. 1.0 Crore each | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |
| **150** | Page- 14 Section- CSP MQR | CSP should have at least 2 data centers Empaneled by MEITY (Ministry of Electronics and Information Technology) on MEITY Website.<br>Documentary Evidence: CSP MEITY Empanelment Certificate<br>And Security Audit Certificate from STQC | CSP is MeitY empaneled and is audited by STQC. CSP gets empanelment letter, based on successful audit by STQC as part of empanelment process and successful STQC audit is mentioned in the same. STQC doesn't issue any separate certificate to CSP. Therefore, as documentary evidence, please accept only the CSP's MEITY empanelment certificate, which would be clearly mentioning the STQC audit validity and status. | No Change; Tender Conditions Prevail |

| 151 | Page- 12 Section-MSP Eligibility Criteria (Folder-ECDOCS) Clause 7 & 9 | 1. Compliance of Offered CSP with CSP EC - "Self Certified by CSP's authorized representative" 2. Confirmation of the Services/ Resources being offered against each of the requirements are Equivalent or Higher Specifications and its public listed price against the same. This certification must be on CSP's letter head and from its authorized representative. | Kindly confirm our understanding of the CSP's authorized representative will be a board's authorized representative with power attorney and/or its country head/CEO. | Certificate must be from board's authorized representative with power attorney and/or its country head/CEO on CSP letterhead |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 152 | Page- 41 Section- 6.3 Price Bid/ Bill of Quantity (BOQ) | | We will request COAL India to consider CSPs whose prices are pegged in USD rates. These rates would be referenced to the RBI USD to INR rate at the time of invoicing. This will prevent unnecessary forex risk hedging being front loaded to the bid by the bidders quoting in INR. This will also prevent the risk of bidders failing to support the project in case of USD to INR fluctuations in future. As an alternative, COAL India may also consider pegging a constant rate for USD to INR conversion and re-looking the pegged rate if the same moves by 5% in either direction in future. Also, cloud prices varies over the period of time; and in the past, there have been several instances of price reduction. As result, we request the following clause be considered: PRICES VARIATION CLAUSE (PRICE ESCALATION/ DE-ESCALATION): a) Bidders are requested to offer their | Refer to Page 46 of RFP |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| **153** | Page- BOQ Section- C. Network and Security Services

API Gateway | Unit Price Description "Per API Gateway Per month" | Unit price description is already stating, "Per API Gateway per month". Specification of 730 hours in 'Unit Price Description' is causing the total list price to be double counted. Therefore, we request to consider "Per API Gateway Per Hour" while arriving at the CSP Public Listed Price Per Unit | not relevant |
| **154** | Page- BOQ Section- G. Machine Learning & IOT
'Fully managed machine learning service that automatically extracts text and data from scanned documents: Number of pages processed | Price per number of pages | Kindly confirm if "Unit Price Description" value can be considered as "Price per page" instead of "Price per number of pages".
Also, kindly confirm if "Quantity Description" field implies total number of pages processed. | not relevant |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 155 | Page- 21 & 33 Section- Analytics and IOT sr no. 12-17 Deployment and Management sr. no 70 | "Fully managed" | Please confirm the understanding of "fully managed," wherein CSP natively manages runtime, middleware, operating system, virtualization, servers, storage, networking, licenses along with its upgrades, patches, upscale/downscale automatically through the service functionalities or attributes, automated tools and without any manual intervention. The service should have native integration with the CSP monitoring platform/service to enable effective operational view with defined matrices and alarms. These services should have an integration with the management console of the CSP to provide single view of all resources. | Refer to Page 47 of RFP |
| 156 | Page- 121 Appendix II Proforma of Bank Guarantee for Performance Security | The date of guarantee shall cover a period of sixty (60) months from the date of issuance of LOA | | The date of guarantee shall cover a period of Fifty-One (51) months from the date of issuance of LOA |
| 157 | BoQ | Compute Requirements | | All processors should be on X64 platform for compute and PaaS |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| **158** | BoQ | List Pricing | | If Public Pricing Is not available for the items/Service configurations in IaaS or PaaS Sections of BoQ , It may be Derived from the Available configurations in public Pricing of Equivalent or higher technical specifications. The clarifications for the same to be given along with the Unpriced BoQ |